

## The Mysterious Malady Evidence Rubric

**Memo 1**

	<b>4</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>Quantity of Evidence</b>	Our evidence comes from at least 3 different kinds of sources specifically addressing the effects of black mold on health.	Our evidence comes from 3 sources specifically addressing the effects of black mold on health.	Our evidence comes from only 2 sources, or one of our sources only vaguely addresses the effects of black mold on health.	Our evidence comes from only 1 source, or none of our sources specifically address the effects of black mold on health.
<b>Quality of Evidence</b>	All our evidence comes from experts from credible organizations in the field and is supported with statistics about black mold's effects on health.	All our evidence comes from experts from credible or unbiased organizations in the field, is factually based, and/or gives pros and cons on black mold's effects on health.	Most of our evidence about black mold's effects on health comes from experts in credible or unbiased organizations, but some of our evidence is opinion without factual or statistical support.	Our evidence comes from biased organizations and consists of opinion without factual or statistical support.
<b>Relevance of Evidence</b>	All our evidence makes a strong and convincing case that black mold is or is not the cause of Sally's illness.	Most of our evidence makes a strong and convincing case that black mold is or is not the cause of Sally's illness, but a small part of our evidence may be open to different interpretations.	Some of our evidence makes a case that black mold is or is not the cause of Sally's illness, but much of our evidence may be irrelevant or open to different interpretations.	Very little of our evidence makes a case that black mold is or is not the cause of Sally's illness, and most of our evidence is irrelevant and open to different interpretations.

**Memo 2**

	<b>4</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>Quantity of Evidence</b>	Our evidence comes from at least 6 different kinds of sources, with abundant evidence relating to both black mold and radon.	Our evidence comes from 6 sources, with sufficient evidence relating to both black mold and radon.	Our evidence comes from only 4 or 5 sources, or one factor (black mold or radon) does not have a satisfactory amount of evidence.	Our evidence comes from two or fewer sources, or our sources do not address either topic (black mold or radon) satisfactorily.
<b>Relevance of Evidence</b>	The accumulation of our evidence makes a strong and convincing case that black mold, radon, or a combination of the two factors is or is not the cause of Sally's illness.	The accumulation of our evidence makes a strong and convincing case that black mold, radon, or a combination of the two factors is or is not the cause of Sally's illness, but portions of our evidence may be irrelevant or open to different interpretations.	The accumulation of our evidence attempts to make a case that black mold, radon, or a combination of the two factors is or is not the cause of Sally's illness, but much of our evidence is irrelevant or open to different interpretations.	The accumulation of our evidence does not make a case that black mold, radon, or a combination of the two factors is or is not the cause of Sally's illness, and most of our evidence is irrelevant and open to different interpretations.

**Memo 3**

	<b>4</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>Quantity of Evidence</b>	Our evidence comes from at least 3 different kinds of sources specifically addressing the effects of carbon monoxide on health, and at least one source convincingly identifies the source of the gas.	Our evidence comes from 3 sources specifically addressing the effects of carbon monoxide on health, and at least one source identifies the source of the gas.	Our evidence comes from only 2 sources addressing the effects of carbon monoxide on health, or none of our sources identifies the source of the gas.	Our evidence comes from only 1 source, or our sources do not specifically address the effect of carbon monoxide on health and do not identify the source of the gas.
<b>Quality of Evidence</b>	All our evidence makes a strong and convincing case that carbon monoxide is or is not the cause of Sally's illness.  Our evidence strongly supports our identification of the source of the gas in her home.	Most of our evidence makes a strong and convincing case that carbon monoxide is or is not the cause of Sally's illness, but a small part of our evidence may be open to different interpretations.  Our evidence supports our identification of the source of the gas in her home.	Some of our evidence makes a case that carbon monoxide is or is not the cause of Sally's illness, but much of our evidence may be irrelevant or open to different interpretations.  Our evidence weakly supports our identification of the source of the gas in her home.	Very little of our evidence makes a case that carbon monoxide is or is not the cause of Sally's illness, and most of our evidence is irrelevant and open to different interpretations.  We do not identify the source of the gas with any accuracy.

**Memo 4**

	<b>4</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>Quantity of Evidence</b>	Our evidence comes from at least 3 different kinds of sources that support our claim that Freon has or has not leaked into Sally's home and has created phosgene that is causing the family's sickness.	Our evidence comes from at least 3 sources that support our claim that Freon has or has not leaked into Sally's home and has created phosgene that is causing the family's sickness.	Our evidence comes from 2 sources that support our claim that Freon has or has not leaked into Sally's home.	Our evidence comes from 1 source that supports our claim that Freon has or has not leaked into Sally's home.
<b>Quality of Evidence</b>	All our evidence makes a strong and convincing case that Freon has or has not leaked into the home.	Most of our evidence makes a strong and convincing case that Freon has or has not leaked into the home, but a small part of our evidence may be open to different interpretations.	Some of our evidence makes a case that Freon has or has not leaked into the home, but much of our evidence may be irrelevant or open to different interpretations.	Very little of our evidence makes a case that Freon has or has not leaked into the home, and most of our evidence is irrelevant and open to different interpretations.